

COMPARISON MODULE OVERVIEW

SKILL: COMPARISON

This module focuses on **comparison** through an examination of South and North Korea. The two activities lead toward a document-based question (DBQ) that addresses the economic impact of differing ideologies.

CONTENT: AP WORLD C.F. KEY CONCEPT 6.3

After the Korean War (1950-1953), the role of the state in the domestic economy varied, and new institutions of global associations emerged and continued to develop throughout the twentieth century.

DAY 1

What is the state's role in developing the economy?

CLASS ACTIVITY: Comparing North and South Korea through Sources

Students work collaboratively to compare the roles that the state, ideology, and historical developments played in the development of North and South Korea's economies after World War II until the 1980s. During the activity, students construct evidenced-based interpretations using North and South Korean sources, culminating in a thesis statement and contextualization.

AP ALIGNED ASSESSMENT: Long Essay Question (LEQ)

Long Essay Question—Thesis and Contextualization Focus: "Develop an argument that evaluates the extent to which the governments of North and South Korea differed in developing their economies."

DAY 2

How did economic models, ideologies, and political structures differ between North and South Korea after 1950?

CLASS ACTIVITY: Escape Room!!!! Comparing North and South Korea

Students work in groups to apply content knowledge from pre-assigned homework readings about North and South Korea to a sequence of puzzles in an "escape room" scenario. The activity involves some advance teacher and student preparation, but the puzzle work and group interaction reinforce material that is sometimes challenging.

AP ALIGNED ASSESSMENT: Long Essay Question (LEQ)

Long Essay Question—Thesis writing: "Evaluate the extent to which ideologies influenced the outcome of economic or political planning in North Korea or South Korea after 1951."

DAY 3

CLASS ACTIVITY: Teaching the Document-Based Question (DBQ)

Students can practice three targeted document-based question skills: thesis writing, contextualization, and sourcing. Students do not need extensive knowledge of Korean history. Teachers could alternatively assign students to write the full AP-aligned DBQ.

AP ALIGNED ASSESSMENT: Document-Based Question

Document-Based Question: **Evaluate the extent to which political ideologies affected the economies of Korea after 1945.**

COMPARISON MODULE SOURCES

DAY 1

AUTHOR	SOURCE	DATE
1. Mao Zedong	Telegram to Filippov (Josef Stalin)	1952
2. Kim Il-sung	Speech to the Korean Workers' Party Central Committee	1956
3. Kim Il-sung	Speech to the 5th Congress of Korean Workers' Party	1970
4. North Korea	Propaganda poster targeted at "Young Heroes"	1985
5. Syngman Rhee	Letter on U.S. economic development of South Korea	1954
6. Park Chung-hee	Semi-autobiographical account of South Korea's progress	1971
7. Kim Dae-jung	Speech addressing South Korea's economy	1985
8. Kwan S. Kim	Working paper addressing "The Korean Miracle"	1991

DAY 2

AUTHOR	SOURCE	DATE
1. C. Wolf, Jr. and N. Levin	Report on attempts to modernize North Korea	2008
2. Bruce Cumings	Influences on development	2005
3. Jongwoo Han	Political, economic, and ideological features	2013
4. CIA	Memorandum on economic development	1972
5. Jongwoo Han	Article on Korean economic development	2018

DAY 3

AUTHOR	SOURCE	DATE
1. Syngman Rhee	Presidential Inaugural Address	1948
2. Kim Il-Sung	Speech, "On Eliminating Dogmatism..."	1955
3. Yi Sujong	"Declaration of the Seoul National Un. Students' Assoc."	1960
4. Park Chung-hee	<i>To Build a Nation</i>	1971
5. Anonymous	Student fliers and slogans	1980s
6. Kim Dae-jung	Presidential Inaugural Address	1998
7. North Korea	Publicity poster, 50th anniversary	1998

DAY 3

BASED ON A 60-MINUTE CLASS

Lesson Question: How do political ideologies affect economic development?

AP CURRICULUM FRAMEWORK REFERENCE

Centered on Thematic Learning Objective CUL-2—Explain how religions, belief systems, philosophies, and ideologies affected political, economic, and social developments over time.

Key Concept 6.3—After the Korean War (1950-1953), the role of the state in the domestic economy varied, and new institutions of global associations emerged and continued to develop throughout the twentieth century.

- I. States responded in a variety of ways to the economic challenges of the 20th century.
 - A. In communist states, such as the Soviet Union and China, governments controlled their national economies, often through repressive policies and with negative repercussions for their populations. [North Korea]
 - C. In new independent states after World War II, governments often took on a strong economic role in guiding economic life to promote development [larger development]
 - D. In a trend accelerated by the end of the Cold War, many governments encouraged free-market economic policies and promoted economic liberalization in the late 20th century [South Korea]

Historical Reasoning Skills: COMPARISON, CAUSATION

OVERVIEW

This activity is designed to engage students in three particular skills involved in writing a document-based question: thesis statement, contextualization, and sourcing. Students do not need to have extensive knowledge of Korean history, although the activities for Day 1 and Day 2 provide useful content introduction to this DBQ activity. Students will have the entire class period to engage with three skills involved in writing and evaluating the document-based question, which comprises 25% of their AP World History exam score. Teachers should note that they can expand this lesson to have students write a full DBQ if time permits.

MATERIALS NEEDED FOR:

Homework

- Copies of the document-based question for every student

In Class Activity

- Gallery Walk instructions document for breakdown and analysis of prompt
- Markers
- Butcher paper
- Graphic organizer for contextualization of the argument and thesis refinement
- Handouts for sourcing the documents

SEQUENCE OF INSTRUCTION

HOMework OVERVIEW

HOMEWORK (30 MINUTES):

Homework Document: [Document-Based Question \(p. 8\)](#)

Students will read the documents (teachers might choose to include the prompt or simply allow students to focus on the documents) addressing the political ideologies that affected the economies of Korea after 1950.

The purpose of the homework is to:

- Prepare students to understand the prompt and documents for this DBQ.
- Have students gain practice in three of the essential tasks for the DBQ.

Teacher Notes

If teachers are not able to assign the DBQ as homework, students can take time in class to read over the DBQ in order to prepare for reading the sample essays. With this approach, students will not have time to write their own thesis and contextualization statements unless this lesson is carried over more than one class period. One alternative is to assign the thesis statement as homework for the next day.

Teaching Tip



Teachers may want their students to practice writing the full DBQ rather than just providing contextualization, sourcing the documents, and writing the thesis statement. Teachers might choose to use two class periods in order to allow students to write a full DBQ. This lesson has been designed for flexibility so that teachers can make decisions based on the specific needs of their students.

CLASS ACTIVITY: WARM UP/INTRODUCTION

WARM UP/INTRODUCTION (10 MINUTES):

ACTIVITY 1: BRAINSTORM ORGANIZATION (5 MINUTES)

Students will discuss the prompt and brainstorm several possible ways to organize the documents in response to the prompt. In groups of three or four, students will use the warm-up part of the classroom organizer to discuss possible ways to organize an argument. They will identify possible components to organize into a **working** thesis and write it at the top of a piece of butcher paper that will develop into a [Gallery Walk document \(p. 13\)](#) by the end of class, but it should be made clear that the components are tentative at this point. Student groups will discuss the organization options and tentative thesis components in order to choose one system of organization to use for the other activities.

ACTIVITY 2: BRAINSTORM CONTEXT (5 MINUTES)

Students will brainstorm contextualization options to use for the argument chosen by their group. The graphic organizer will direct them to discussions, but it should be made clear that their contextualization is tentative and will depend on the final thesis decision.

Teacher Notes

The warm-up activities are designed to provide a first pass through the argument-organization process. Teachers should encourage students to explore the options in a short amount of time in order to help them adjust to time constraints in a real DBQ setting.

Teaching Tip



Teachers also have the option of asking students to work on the prompt analysis and contextualization activities as part of the homework, but students may be less intimidated when allowed to complete those activities in groups. Since the goal of the lesson is to have students better organize their arguments in preparation for writing the DBQ, teachers might be better off asking students to consider an argument structure and contextualization during the homework reading, but they should clarify that time will be given for group work during the classroom warm-up.

CLASS ACTIVITY PART 1: DOCUMENT SOURCING, CONTEXTUALIZATION, AND THESIS REFINEMENT

CLASS ACTIVITY (35 MINUTES):

ACTIVITY 1: DOCUMENT SOURCING (22 MINUTES)

Students will work in their groups to analyze the documents of the DBQ using the [Document Sourcing for DBQ handout \(p. 14\)](#). Students will discuss and write possible ways to evaluate the use of each document in crafting a response to the prompt. Each student can take notes on separate handouts. Then they can compare their individual sourcing ideas as they analyze the historical situation, intended audience, purpose, and point of view (HIPP) for each document. Groups will choose the best responses for each document and complete one copy per group of the [Group Copy of Document Sourcing for DBQ handout \(p. 18\)](#) to present to the class for the gallery walk. They can either write the sourcing choices by hand, or paste the sourcing handout directly onto the [Gallery Walk document \(p. 13\)](#).

Teaching Tip



Teachers may want to assign the HIPP handout as part of the homework assignment so that students can spend more of the time in class identifying strong examples of each component from their group members' responses.

Teaching Tip



Teachers may want to have students copy their HIPP responses onto a sheet of butcher paper, or they can tape or paste their group copy onto the butcher paper as they combine the activities for the gallery walk.

Teaching Tip



Teachers will want to circulate among the groups to provide hints for sourcing, remind groups that material already provided in the documents does not count for sourcing, and keep work moving forward. Time reminders are key. Students should come to understand the importance of developing a fast pace when analyzing documents. Teachers can remind students that only one component of the HIPP sourcing is required per document, but that practicing analyzing different parts of HIPP helps build skill and speed.

Teaching Tip



Teachers can find the full handout with source text embedded in the following link for [Document to Source for DBQ](#).

ACTIVITY 2: CONTEXTUALIZATION (6 MINUTES)

Students will work in their groups to further develop the contextualization they brainstormed in the warmup. Students will extend their brainstormed ideas and write three to five sentences of context for their working thesis and the documents they have sourced. They will use the [Contextualization and Thesis Revision handout \(p. 20\)](#) to compile their examples and choose the one that best aligns with the group's working thesis. They will transfer that example onto the gallery walk butcher paper.

ACTIVITY 3: THESIS REFINEMENT (7 MINUTES)

Students will use the [Contextualization and Thesis Revision handout \(p. 20\)](#) to review the prompt, document sourcing, and contextualization to refine the thesis their group will use to state their argument. They will write the revised thesis on the [Gallery Walk document \(p. 13\)](#).

CLASS ACTIVITY PART 2: GALLERY WALK AND DEBRIEF**CLASS ACTIVITY (15 MINUTES):**

ACTIVITY 1: GALLERY WALK (15 MINUTES)

Students will paste their butcher paper and gallery walk document work onto the classroom walls. Students will take a gallery walk to review at least two other posters and evaluate different structures created by other groups.

ACTIVITY 2: OPTIONAL DEBRIEF

Students will analyze and discuss the components of each group's DBQ practice work. Teachers can direct the discussion through the following possible questions:

- How many different argument organizations did you notice in the gallery walk?
 - Would you change anything about the contextualization and thesis you and your group created?
-

IN-CLASS ACTIVITY MATERIALS

Document-Based Question

Suggested reading and writing time: 1 hour

You should spend 15 minutes reading the documents and 45 minutes writing your response.

Note: You may begin writing your response before the reading period is over.

Directions

Question 1 is based on the accompanying documents. The documents have been edited for the purpose of this exercise.

In your response, you should do the following.

- Respond to the prompt with a historically defensible thesis or claim that establishes a line of reasoning.
- Describe a broader historical context relevant to the prompt.
- Support an argument in response to the prompt using specific and relevant examples of evidence from at least six documents.
- For at least three documents, explain how the author's point of view, author's purpose, historical situation, and/or audience is relevant to an argument.
- Explain how at least one additional piece of historical evidence beyond those found in the documents relates to an argument about the question.
- Use evidence to corroborate, qualify, or modify an argument that addresses the prompt.

1. **Evaluate the extent to which political ideologies affected the economies of Korea after 1945.**

DOCUMENT 1

SOURCE: Syngman Rhee, President of South Korea 1948-1960, Presidential Inaugural Address, 15 August 1948,
<http://syngmanrhee.kr/20/?q=YToxOntzOjEyOjRZXl3b3JkX3R5cGUiO3M6MzoiYWxsIjt9&bmode=view&idx=263903&t=board>.

Among our people there are those who believe that without a dictatorship there is no way to move forward from these difficult times or those who think that there is no method other than dictatorship because they hold the view we lack the wisdom and ability to solve the serious problem created by the destructive communist movement. But we all think this is regrettable.

We will never permit our democratic principles, which give us permanent benefits, to be invalidated because of temporary obstacles. It has been proven by history that dictatorship cannot bring about freedom or progress.

Translated by Gregg Brazinsky

DOCUMENT 2

SOURCE: Kim Il-sung, leader of North Korea 1948-1994, speech, "On Eliminating Dogmatism and Formalism and Establishing Juche in Ideological Work," 1955.

It is of paramount importance to study, and widely publicize among the working people, the history of our country and of our people's struggle, before anything else.

This is not the first time we have raised this question. As far back as the autumn of 1945, that is, immediately after liberation, we emphasized the need to study the history of our nation's struggle and to inherit its fine traditions. Only when our people are educated in the history of their own struggle and its traditions, can their national pride be stimulated and the broad masses be aroused to the revolutionary struggle.

Yet, many of our functionaries are ignorant of our country's history, and so do not strive to discover and carry forward its fine traditions. Unless this is corrected, it will lead, in the long run, to the negation of Korean history.....

It is important in our work to grasp revolutionary truth, Marxist-Leninist truth, and apply it correctly to the actual conditions of our country. There can be no set principle that we must follow the Soviet pattern. Some advocate the Soviet way and others the Chinese, but it is not high time to work out our own?

The point is that we should not mechanically copy forms and methods of the Soviet Union, but should learn from its experience in struggle and Marxist-Leninist truth. So, while learning from the experience of the Soviet Union, we must put stress not on the forms but on learning the essence of its experience.

Source: Marxists Internet Archive

DOCUMENT 3

SOURCE: Yi Sujong, student leader, "Declaration of the Seoul National University Students Association," April 1960.

We have stepped out from the ivory tower into the streets [to take part in the demonstration] against Syngman Rhee[']s regime. By participating in the whirlwind of historical currents, we want to plant the seeds of reason, truth, freedom, and the spirit of the university in the barren soil of our country.

In the name of reason and conscience, we hereby indict the regime in power for creating the present misery and evil and demand the rectification of the current intolerable situation. We firmly believe that the bleak reality facing our country is caused by the abuse of despotic power by the present regime, which falsely pretends to follow democracy and freedom. The political history of democracy has been a history of the struggle for freedom. It has taught us that despotism, whatever form it may take to dominate the people, is nothing more than a paper tiger.

Just as we are very proud of the courageous struggle our university waged against the despotism of Communism in its short history, we take great pride in resisting the despotism of the extreme right-wing political group, which has put a sham facade on democracy. The foundation of modern democracy is freedom. And yet, we are now witnessing our freedom being taken away—nay, our freedom is being eradicated in total by the despotic regime.

Peter H. Lee, William Theodore de Bary, and Yŏngho Ch'oe. Sources of Korean Tradition, Vol. 2: From the Sixteenth to the Twentieth Centuries, Columbia University Press, 2000. Used with permission of Columbia University Press.

DOCUMENT 4

SOURCE: Park Chung-hee, President of South Korea 1963-1979, *To Build a Nation*, 1971.

When I took over power as the leader of the revolutionary group on 16 May 1961, I felt, honestly speaking, as if I had been given a pilfered household or a bankrupt firm to manage. Around me I could find little hope or encouragement. The outlook was bleak.

To achieve this stability, the military revolutionary government temporarily suspended political activities of students, the press, labor unions, and other social and political organizations, which had caused political crises and social unrest during the rule of the Democratic Party regime. We also made it clear that civilian government would be restored in 1963.

Meanwhile, we organized a planning committee of college professors and experts with specialized knowledge in many fields. By mobilizing the maximum available expertise for government administration and policy making, we intended to hold in check the arbitrariness and rashness of the military officers. The establishment of this committee served as a turning point. Korean professors began to show positive interest in the realities of the country and to present policy recommendations on the basis of scientific analyses of the country's situation. Even though not all of these recommendations could be justified in terms of efficiency and rationality, their advice was of great help to the revolutionary government. Thus the Confucian tradition of Yi Korea, in which scholars played a positive part in government affairs, seems to have been revived.

DOCUMENT 5

SOURCE: Anonymous quotations from South Korean student fliers and slogans, 1980s.

"Our target is the comprador *chaebol* that exploits the masses' labor while remaining blind to their avariciousness."

"Let's dismantle the comprador *chaebols* that fill their bellies by selling the nation!"

"Tear down the thieving, swindling, monopolistic *chaebol*!"

DOCUMENT 6

SOURCE: Kim Dae-jung, President of South Korea 1998-2003, Presidential Inaugural Address, February 1998.

My Fellow Citizens: You have demonstrated remarkable patriotism and power even in today's difficulties. We have accomplished a peaceful transition of power even in the midst of the IMF [International Monetary Fund] Crisis. You have gathered gold to overcome the national crisis and have already collected over \$2 billion in gold. I am very proud of your patriotism, which is more valuable than gold.

Our workers share the burden and agree to no raises, despite the challenges they face every day. Businesses have built a surplus for the past three months by focusing on increased exports. This patriotic commitment and the resilience of the Korean people is earning widespread recognition across the globe...

Translated by Youngeun Kim

DOCUMENT 7

SOURCE: Official North Korean government publicity poster commemorating the 50th anniversary of the founding of the government, displayed in Pyongyang and other areas in North Korea, 1998.



Poster features President Kim Il-sung (left) and his wife Kim Jeong-suk. Translation: "Let's have a harvest full of fruits and meat!"

"Kim Jong Il's sushi chef returns after fleeing for life," by Paula Hancocks, CNN, September 19, 2012, from Imperial Chinese Regency: Advocacy via Regency for Constitutional Monarchy in China

Gallery Walk Instructions for DBQ

Skills Practice

Directions

1. Write a first draft for the three sections below.
2. Revise your Thesis in section 4
3. Transfer your answers to the butcher paper using markers and the butcher paper provided. Give each section one fourth of the page.

1. Working Thesis: Write this at the top of your group's butcher paper to use as your roadmap through discussions about sourcing and contextualization.

2. HIPP Sourcing: Choose the best sourcing for each document based on the working thesis statement. You may handwrite the sourcing or paste the group's document directly onto the butcher paper.

3. Contextualization: Choose the best contextualization for the working thesis and write it clearly below the sourcing.

4. Thesis Revision: Review the prompt, sourcing, and contextualization to determine any changes that might need to be made to the thesis statement. Once the group has decided on any changes, revise the thesis statement and transfer onto the butcher paper.

When all groups have put their gallery walk papers on display, each group should examine the responses of other groups and compare them. Be ready to discuss strengths of the gallery walk pages.

Document Sourcing for DBQ

Directions

Use the HIPP technique to analyze sourcing for the following documents. As you source each document, consider how it would operate in the context of writing a document-based question. In what overall context can the documents be placed? Will the sourcing description you create fit into an overall argument that responds to the prompt? Write one or two sentences developing your source analysis for each of the components and be ready to discuss this with your group members.

Historical context:

What events were developing in the place and the time period in which the document was produced? How do those events apply to the creation of the document? To what broad historical theme(s) does the source relate?

Intended audience:

For whom was the source created? Was the intended audience broader than the stated addressee?

Purpose of document:

What was the author hoping to achieve by producing the source?

Point of view of author:

Based on the author's identity, how does the author view the topic? Don't just restate the document's content. Discuss the author's support, opposition, and/or concerns about the topic being addressed. Remember that each author has multiple components to her/his identity, such as gender, social background, economic status, political persuasion, ethnicity, nationality, religion, and race. Which part of the author's identity informs the creation of the document?

DOCUMENT 1

SOURCE: Syngman Rhee, President of South Korea 1948-1960, Presidential Inaugural Address, 15 August 1948.

H

I

P

P

DOCUMENT 2

SOURCE: Kim Il-sung, leader of North Korea 1948-1994, speech, "On Eliminating Dogmatism and Formalism and Establishing Juche in Ideological Work," 1955.

H

I

P

P

DOCUMENT 3

SOURCE: Yi Sujong, student leader, "Declaration of the Seoul National University Students' Association," April 1960.

H

I

P

P

DOCUMENT 4

SOURCE: Park Chung-hee, President of South Korea 1963-1979, *To Build a Nation*, 1971.

H

I

P

P

DOCUMENT 5

SOURCE: Anonymous quotations from South Korean student fliers and slogans, 1980s.

H

I

P

P

DOCUMENT 6

SOURCE: Kim Dae-jung, President of South Korea 1998-2003, Presidential Inaugural Address, February 1998.

H

I

P

P

DOCUMENT 7

SOURCE: Official North Korean government publicity poster commemorating the 50th anniversary of the founding of the government, displayed in Pyongyang and other areas in North Korea, 1998.

H

I

P

P

Group Copy of Document Sourcing for DBQ

Directions

As a group, use the HIPP source technique to analyze sourcing for the following documents. As you and your group members discuss the sourcing of each document, consider how it would operate in the context of writing a document-based question. Which of the sourcing possibilities works best for each document? Do they connect to the overall argument your thesis describes? Once you and your group mates have chosen the sourcing for the document, identify which type of sourcing it is and write one or two sentences explaining its significance in the boxes below. You will attach your sourcing explanations to your gallery walk presentation.

Historical context:

What events were developing in the place and the time period in which the document was produced? How do those events apply to the creation of the document? To what broad historical theme(s) does the source relate?

Intended audience:

For whom was the source created? Was the intended audience broader than the stated addressee?

Purpose of document:

What was the author hoping to achieve by producing the source?

Point of view of author:

Based on the author's identity, how does the author view the topic? Don't just restate the document's content. Discuss the author's support, opposition, and/or concerns about the topic being addressed. Remember that each author has multiple components to her/his identity, such as gender, social background, economic status, political persuasion, ethnicity, nationality, religion, and race. Which part of the author's identity informs the creation of the document?

DOCUMENT 1

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

DOCUMENT 2

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

DOCUMENT 3

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

DOCUMENT 4

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

DOCUMENT 5

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

DOCUMENT 6

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

DOCUMENT 7

Type of Sourcing (H, I, P, or POV?):

Contextualization and Thesis

Revision for DBQ

CONTEXTUALIZATION

To earn the contextualization point in a DBQ, your response must relate the topic of the prompt to broader historical events, developments, or processes that occur before, during, or continue after the timeframe of the question. This point is not awarded merely for a phrase or reference, so two to five sentences should be deployed to develop the contextualization.

Directions

Based on the prompt, consider three broader historical events, developments, or processes that contributed to the general topic shared by the documents. Be sure your contextualization examples connect clearly to your working thesis statement. Once you have developed three contributing factors, choose the strongest example of contextualization for your group's argument. Write it on your gallery butcher paper.

Example 1:

Example 2:

Example 3:

THESIS REVISION

Now that you have chosen sourcing analysis for the seven documents and developed contextualization for your group's argument, return to your working thesis statement. Discuss the following questions, making any revisions to the thesis statement that are needed to support your argument based on your sourcing analysis.

Write the working thesis here:

Question 1: Does the thesis statement answer all parts of the prompt?

Does anything need to be added to the thesis statement to account for all of the documents?

Question 2: Does each document provide evidence that supports the thesis statement?

For any that do not, do they contradict the thesis statement in a way that can be analyzed and explained?

Question 3: What changes should be made to the thesis statement, if any?

Rewrite the thesis with any appropriate changes below.
